

Table 9-2
Comparison of Remedial Alternatives
Containment Area
Investigation Area H1
Mare Island, Vallejo, California

| Evaluation Criteria | Alternative 1 No Action | Alternative 2A Multilayer RCRA/Non- RCRA Cap | Alternative 2B Uniform RCRA Cap | Alternative 3 Removal with Off-Site Disposal |
|---|------------------------------------|---|--|---|
| Overall Protection of Human Health and the Environment | No | Yes | Yes | Yes |
| Compliance with ARARs | No | Yes | Yes | Yes |
| Long-Term Effectiveness | 3 | 2 | 2 | 1 |
| Reduction of Toxicity, Mobility, Volume by Treatment | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 |
| Short-Term Effectiveness | 3 | 1 | 1 | 4 |
| Implementability | 1 | 2 | 2 | 5 |
| Cost | n/a | 31,300,000 | 34,000,000 | 218,201,000 |
| Total Score | 12 | 10 | 10 | 15 |
| Overall Rating | 4 | 1 | 2 | 3 |
| Alternative Meets Threshold Criteria? Yes/No Balancing Criteria Ranking Scale (Alternative with lowest Total Score receives best Overall Rating) 1 Meets Criteria Best 5 Meets Criteria Least * No Action Alternative does meet threshold criteria and therefore obtains least favorable Overall Rating | | | | |

Note:

ARAR = Applicable or Relevant and Appropriate Requirement

RCRA = Resource Conservation and Recovery Act

With equal scores, 2A is rated better than 2B because of lower cost

n/a = Not applicable